

Article Info

 Open Access

Citation: Shawish, R.R., El-Bagory, A.M., Elnahriry, S.S., Wafy, H.A., Sayed, H.H., 2020. Incidence of Antibiotic Resistant Coliforms in Poultry Meat in Menoufia Governorate, Egypt. PSM Microbiol., 5(1): 7-13.

Received: February 18, 2020

Accepted: February 29, 2020

Published: March 31, 2020

***Corresponding Author:**
Shimaa Samir Elnahriry

Email:
kamelsamir95@yahoo.com

Copyright: ©2020 PSM. This work is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License.

For possible
submissions click
below

[Submit Article](#)

Incidence of Antibiotic Resistant Coliforms in Poultry Meat in Menoufia Governorate, Egypt

Reyad R. Shawish¹, Abd-Rahman M. El-Bagory², Shimaa Samir Elnahriry^{3*}, Heba A. Wafy⁴, Haitham Helmy Sayed⁵

¹Department of Food Hygiene & Control, Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, University of Sadat City, Menoufia 32958, Egypt.

²Department of Food Hygiene & Control, Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, Menoufia University, Menoufia 32958, Egypt.

³Department of Bacteriology, Mycology, and Immunology, Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, University of Sadat City, Menoufia 32958, Egypt.

⁴Directorate of Veterinary Medicine, El-Menoufia Governorate, Egypt.

⁵Department of Microbiology, Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, Sohag University, Sohag, 82524, Egypt.

Abstract:

A total of 100 random samples of fresh chicken cuts (50 each of breast and thigh) were collected from different butcher's shops at Menoufia Governorate. The samples were examined for the coliform count, isolation and identification of *coliform strains*, and antibiotic sensitivity. The obtained results indicated that the coliform count varied from 2.7×10^2 to 9.1×10^4 CFU/g for chicken thigh and 2.3×10^2 to 6.3×10^4 CFU/g for chicken breast respectively. Coliform isolates were identified as *Escherichia coli*, *Citrobacter freundii*, *Citrobacter diversus*, *Enterobacter agglomerans*, *Enterobacter aerogenes*, *Enterobacter cloacae*, *Enterobacter hafniae*, *Serratia liquefaciens*, *Klebsiella pneumoniae* and *Klebsiella ozaenae*. Moreover, the serological examination of *E. coli* isolates revealed *E. coli* O86: K6, *E. coli* O55: K59, *E. coli* O125: K70, *E. coli* O128: K67, *E. coli* O26: K60 and *E. coli* O111: K58. Antimicrobial resistance among isolated coliform strains was detected by susceptibility to 8 antibiotics by disc diffusion method. Generally, *E. coli* isolates were resistant to ciprofloxacin, vancomycin, norfloxacin, streptomycin, and kanamycin. *C. freundii* isolates were resistant to ciprofloxacin, vancomycin, erythromycin, cefoxitin, and norfloxacin; *E. agglomerans* isolates were resistant to vancomycin, erythromycin, cefoxitin, streptomycin, and kanamycin. *E. aerogenes* isolates were resistant to vancomycin, cefoxitin, and kanamycin. *E. cloacae* and *K. ozaenae* strains were resistant to ciprofloxacin, norfloxacin, and kanamycin. *S. liquefaciens* strains were resistant to ciprofloxacin, vancomycin, cefoxitin, norfloxacin, and kanamycin. *K. pneumoniae* strain was sensitive to all tested antibiotics. These data suggest that antimicrobial-resistant coliform isolates are widely distributed in the meat and processing environment in Egypt, which can play a role in the dissemination of antimicrobial resistance to other pathogenic and commensal bacteria.

Keywords: Antimicrobial resistance, coliforms, chicken meat, Egypt.

INTRODUCTION

Live birds are highly contaminated with different microorganisms on their feathers, skin, and intestinal tract. Accordingly, the contamination of chicken carcasses begins from the time of slaughtering, de-feathering, evisceration, until the final product storage and distribution (Capita *et al.*, 2004). Coliforms, defined as aerobic or facultatively anaerobic, Gram-negative, non-spore-forming rods capable of fermenting lactose with the production of acid and gas at 32–35°C (Davidson *et al.*, 2004), were originally considered to represent only strains from the genera *Citrobacter*, *Enterobacter*, *Escherichia*, and *Klebsiella*. *Escherichia coli* has emerged as a serious foodborne pathogen associated with numerous outbreaks. *E. coli* strains associated with diarrhea have been classified into six groups based on clinical, epidemiological and molecular criteria (Kalantar, 2013) namely, enterohemorrhagic *E. coli* (EHEC), enterotoxigenic *E. coli* (ETEC), enteropathogenic *E. coli* (EPEC), enteroaggregative *E. coli* (EAEC), Enteroinvasive *E. coli* (EIEC) and diffusely adherent *E. coli* (DAEC) (Gomez-Duarte, 2013). The usage of antibiotics is a major factor in the emergence, selection, and dissemination of antibiotic-resistant microorganisms in both veterinary and human (Tollefson and Flynn, 2002). The practice of using antibiotics in poultry is being questioned, owing to increased resistance to antibiotics (Tiwari *et al.*, 2014). Therefore, the present study aimed at the isolation and identification of coliform from poultry meat (breast and thigh), serological identification of *E.coli*, and to determine the antibiotic sensitivity of some isolated coliform strains.

MATERIAL AND METHODS

Collection of samples

A total of 100 random samples of fresh chicken cuts (50 from breast and 50 from thigh) were collected from different butcher's shops at El-monofia Governorate, Egypt. The collected samples were kept in separate plastic bags, transferred directly to the laboratory in an insulated icebox under complete aseptic conditions without any delay.

Determination of Coliform count

The coliform count was done following recommendations by ICMSF (1996), APHA (1992).

Identification of coliforms

Suspected isolates of coliform bacteria were identified following previous studies (MacFaddin, 2000; Iqbal *et al.*, 2016).

Serological typing of *E.coli*

The isolates of *E. coli*, taken, were subjected to serological identification (Varnam and Evans, 1991) using slide agglutination test.

Antibiotic susceptibility testing

Some isolated coliform strains were subjected to the sensitivity test against different antibiotics, using the Kirby-Bauer method on Mueller-Hinton agar (Bauer *et al.*, 1966).

Statistical analysis

Data were tabulated and an appropriate statistical test, either the t-test or ANOVA, was applied using SPSS 16.

RESULTS

The results demonstrated that the mean values of coliform count in the examined samples were varied from 2.7×10^2 cfu/g to 9.1×10^4 cfu/g with an average value of $7.95 \times 10^4 \pm 2.66 \times 10^4$ cfu/g for chicken thigh and 2.3×10^2 cfu/g to 9.3×10^4 cfu/g with an average value of $6.43 \times 10^3 \pm 1.82 \times 10^4$ cfu/g for chicken

breast (Table 1). The incidence of isolated bacteria was *Citrobacter diversus*, *Citrobacter freundii*, *Enterobacter aerogenes*, *Enterobacter agglomerans*, *Enterobacter cloacae*, *Hafnia alvei*, *Klebsiella pneumoniae subsp. ozaenae*, *Klebsiella pneumoniae subsp. pneumoniae*, *E. coli*, *Serratia liquefaciens* and *Serratia marcescens* (4%, 14%, 16%, 4%, 6%, 4%, 8%, 14%, 16%, 10% and 4%) in breast and (8%, 16%, 4%, 8%, 10%, 2%, 4%, 14%, 20%, 8% and 6%) in thigh respectively (Table 2).

The results in table (3) illustrated the incidence of pathogenic *E. coli* serotypes Enteropathogenic *E. coli* (*E. coli* O86:K61, and *E. coli* O55:K59), Enterotoxigenic *E. coli* (*E. coli* O125:K70, and *E. coli* O128:K67) and Enterohemorrhagic *E. coli* (*E. coli* O26:K60 and *E. coli* O111:K58).

The antimicrobial resistance profile of 8 isolated coliform strains was carried out (*E. coli*, *Citrobacter freundii*, *Enterobacter agglomerans*, *Enterobacter aerogenes*, *Enterobacter cloacae*, *Klebsiella pneumonia subsp. pneumonia*, *Klebsiella pneumonia subsp. ozaenae* and

Serratia liquefaciens), by detecting susceptibility to 8 antibiotics (doxycycline, ciprofloxacin, vancomycin, erythromycin, ceftiofur, norfloxacin, streptomycin, and kanamycin) (Table 4). Generally, *K. pneumonia subsp. pneumonia* strain was sensitive to all tested antibiotic disc, also all strain tested were sensitive to doxycycline and resistant to kanamycin except *C. freundii*.

E. coli was resistant to (ciprofloxacin, vancomycin, norfloxacin, streptomycin, and kanamycin), *C. freundii* was resistant to (ciprofloxacin, vancomycin, erythromycin, and kanamycin), and *E. agglomerans* was resistant to (vancomycin, erythromycin, ceftiofur, streptomycin, and kanamycin) antimicrobial agents. While, *E. aerogenes* was resistant to vancomycin, ceftiofur and kanamycin. *E. cloacae* and *Klebsiella pneumonia subsp. Ozaenae* strains were resistant to ciprofloxacin, norfloxacin, and kanamycin however, *S. liquefaciens* strain was resistant to ciprofloxacin, vancomycin, ceftiofur, norfloxacin, and kanamycin.

Table 1. Coliform count (CFU/g) (Mean±SD) in the examined samples of chicken thigh and breast (n=50).

Samples	NO of positive samples	% of positive samples	Minimum	Maximum	Mean±SD
Thigh	45	90	2.7x10 ²	9.1x10 ⁴	7.95x10 ⁴ ±2.66x10 ⁴
Breast	41	82	2.3x10 ²	9.3x10 ⁴	6.43x10 ³ ±1.82x10 ⁴

Table 2. Incidence of identified coliforms in the examined samples of chicken meat (N=50).

Isolated coliforms	Samples			
	Breast		Thigh	
	No.	%	No.	%
<i>Citrobacter diversus</i>	2	4	4	8
<i>Citrobacter freundii</i>	7	14	8	16
<i>Enterobacter aerogenes</i>	8	16	2	4
<i>Enterobacter agglomerans</i>	2	4	4	8
<i>Enterobacter cloacae</i>	3	6	5	10
<i>Enterobacter hafniae</i>	2	4	1	2
<i>Klebsiella pneumonia subsp. Ozaenae</i>	4	8	2	4
<i>Klebsiella pneumonia subsp. Pneumonia</i>	7	14	7	14
<i>E. coli</i>	8	16	10	20
<i>Serratia liquefaciens</i>	5	10	4	8
<i>Serratia marcescens</i>	2	4	3	6

Table 3. Incidence of identified *E. coli* serotypes isolated from the examined samples of chicken Breast and Thigh.

Isolated Bacteria	Breast		Thigh		
	No	%	No	%	
<i>E. coli</i> O86:k61	2	25.0	3	30	EPEC
<i>E. coli</i> O55:k59	1	12.5	2	20	
<i>E. coli</i> O125:K70	1	12.5	1	10	ETEC
<i>E. coli</i> O128:k67	1	12.5	2	20	
<i>E. coli</i> O26:k60	2	25.0	1	10	EHEC
<i>E. coli</i> O111:k58	1	12.5	1	10	
Total	8	100	10	100	

Table 4. Antibiotic sensitivity test of isolated coliform strains.

Strain	Doxycycline (DO30)	Ciprofloxacin (CP5)	Vancomycin (N30)	Erythromycin (E15)	Cefoxitin (Fox30)	Norfloxacin (NOR10)	Streptomycin (S10)	Kanamycin (K30)
<i>Enterobacter agglomerans</i>	19	22	R	R	R	20	R	R
<i>Enterobacter aerogenes</i>	19	23	R	25	R	18	18	R
<i>Enterobacter cloacae</i>	18	R	19	26	19	R	16	R
<i>Serratia liquefaciens</i>	16	R	R	25	R	R	18	R
<i>E.coli</i>	17	R	R	27	19	R	R	R
<i>Klebsiella ozqence</i>	17	R	23	28	20	R	17	R
<i>Klebsiella pneumonia</i>	20	27	20	24	20	18	16	20
<i>Citrobacter freundii</i>	17	R	R	R	R	R	20	19

DISCUSSION

The contamination with Coliforms may occur during slaughtering, cutting or dressing of carcasses, soiled hands, shopping blocks, or knives for handling and cutting, also contaminated water considered as a source of Coliforms in meat (Yadav *et al.*, 2006). The detection of coliform is used as a general indicator of sanitary conditions in the food-processing environment (Feng *et al.*, 2002). Nearly similar results were reported by (Mohammed *et al.*, 2015) who mentioned that the mean value of total coliform count in chicken meat was 1.7×10^3 cfu/g (Hassanien-Fatin *et al.*,

2016) recorded that the average value of coliform count is $2.61 \times 10^3 \pm 0.60 \times 10^3$ /g for chicken thigh and $2.07 \times 10^3 \pm 0.60 \times 10^3$ /g for chicken breast.

Higher coliforms counts were obtained by (Ruban and Fairuze, 2011) who found that the mean value of fecal coliforms of chicken thigh and breast were 1.42 ± 0.15 and 1.34 ± 0.16 , respectively. Moreover, higher values of coliforms counts were observed in thigh meat compared to breast meat. These results agreed with those obtained by (El-Khawas and Hendy, 2015) who found the mean value of coliforms counts for thigh samples (1.83 log CFU/g) and breast (1.42 log CFU/g).

The presence of coliforms in greater numbers may be responsible for the inferior quality of chicken meat resulting in economic losses and the possibility of the presence of other enteric pathogens, which constitute at time public health hazard (Chaem *et al.*, 2002). Nearly similar results of isolated coliforms were obtained by Kilonzo *et al.* (2013) and Olobatoke *et al.* (2015) who isolated *Enterobacter* (n = 34), *Klebsiella* (n = 13), *Citrobacter* (n = 6), *Serratia* (n = 14), *Hafnia* (n = 9) and *Escherichia* (n = 11). Higher results were observed by Gad (2004), Purabi and Joshi, (2010), Shawish (2011), and Shrestha *et al.* (2017). Lower results were obtained by Yulistiani (2017) and Arueyingho (2019) who isolated *E. coli* (27.82%), *Enterobacter* sp (4.15%), *Klebsiella* sp (1.84%) and *Citrobacter* sp (3.65%). On the other hand, the results of serotyping *E. coli* those obtained by Lee *et al.* (2009) who isolated enterotoxigenic *E. coli* (34.6%) followed by enterohaemorrhagic *E. coli* (35.9%) and finally enteropathogenic *E. coli* (20.5%) and Saif- Marwa (2015) who examined 100 random meat samples of fresh-marketed chicken meat (breast and thigh) and isolated Enteropathogenic *E. coli* (O55: H7 and O78), Enterotoxigenic *E. coli* (O125: H18, O128: H2 and O127: H6), Enterohaemorrhagic *E. coli* (O26 and *E. coli* O111: H4) and Enteroinvasive *E. coli* (O124). Enteropathogenic *E. coli* is a common cause of infantile diarrhea in developing countries. The high prevalence of resistance in poultry meat isolates is alarming given the evidence of possible transmission of antibiotic-resistant foodborne bacteria to consumers and food handlers (Bester and Essack, 2010). The results of antibiotic sensitivity were similar to previous studies. Millman *et al.* (2013) reported that *E. coli* was susceptible to ciprofloxacin, Amosun *et al.* (2012) found *E. coli* resistant to erythromycin, streptomycin, and norfloxacin. Arueyingho (2019) found that *Enterobacter* sp was resistant to erythromycin and gentamicin but *E. coli* isolates were resistant to amoxicillin/clavulanate and erythromycin.

Rasool *et al.* (2003) reported that *K. pneumoniae* was resistant to several antibiotics such as ampicillin, streptomycin, gentamicin, chloramphenicol, tetracycline, and ofloxacin. Another study by Shuhong *et al.* (2018) documented *K. pneumoniae* was resistant to several antibiotics such as ampicillin, streptomycin, and piperacillin.

CONCLUSION

Results concluded that the chicken thigh had a higher significant result than chicken breast for the total coliform count, due to the processing of carcass into parts and cross-contamination from unclean water, cutting tables and knives. Therefore, good hygienic practices should be followed in every step of processing.

CONFLICT OF INTEREST

The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.

REFERENCES

- APHA, 1992. Compendium of Methods for the microbiological examination of Foods. American Public Health Association, Washington D.C., USA. 105 (4): 100-110.
- Amosun, E.A., Ojo, O.E., Alao, I.K., Ajuwape, A.T.P., 2012. Antimicrobial resistance among commensal *Escherichia coli* from cattle faeces and beef in Ibadan, Nigeria. Afr. J. Biotechnol., 11(58): 12240-12245.
- Arueyingho, O.V., 2019. Evaluation of Microbial Isolates from Frozen Chicken Products Sold in Port Harcourt Metropolis and Determination of their Antibiotic Susceptibility Patterns. Acta Scient. Pharma. Sci., 3(4): 7-13.

- Bauer, A.W., Kirby, W.M., Sherris, J.C., Turck, M., 1966. Antibiotic susceptibility testing by a standardized single disk method. *Am. J. Clin. Pathol.*, 45(4): 4936. DOI:10.1093/ajcp/45.4 ts.493. PMID 5325707.
- Bester, L.A., Essack, S.Y., 2010. Antibiotic resistance via the food chain: Fact or fiction? *S. Afri. J. Sci.*, 106(9/10): 1–5.
- Capita, R., Alonso, C., Fernandez, M.D., Moreno, B., 2004. Microbiological quality of retail poultry carcasses in Spain. *J. Food Prot.*, 64(12): 1961-1966.
- Chaem, H., Ahn, C., Park, B., Yon, Y., Cho, S., Choi, Y., 2002. Physicochemical properties of Korean chicken. *Korean J. Poul. Sci.*, 29: 185-194.
- Davidson, P.M., Roth, L.A., Gambrel-Lenarz, S.A., 2004. "Coliform and other indicator bacteria," in *Standard Methods for the Examination of Dairy Products*, 17th Edn, eds Wehr H. M., Frank J. F. (Washington, DC: American Public Health Association;), 187–227.
- El-Khawas, K.M., Hendy, B.A.S., 2015. Assessment and improvement of hygienic status of chicken fillet from slaughter houses using organic acids from natural sources. *Assiut Vet. Med. J.*, 61(147): 8-17.
- Feng, P., Weagent, S.D., Grant, M.A., 2002. Diarrheagenic *Escherichia coli*, Chapter 4a. In *Bacteriological analytical manual online*. [Online.] U.S. Food and Drug Administration, available/etd-04102005-213953/unrestricted/ etd.pdf.
- Gad, M., 2004. Microbiological evaluation of poultry meat and its products. M.V.Sc., Thesis, Fac. Vet. Med., Menoufia University, Egypt.
- Gomez-Duarte, O.G, Romero-Herazo ,Y.C., Paez-Canro, C.Z., Eslava-Schmalbach, J.H., Arzuza, O., 2013. Enterotoxigenic *Escherichia coli* associated with childhood diarrhoea in Colombia, South America. *J. Infect. Dev. Ctries.*, 7(5): 372-381.
- Hassanien- Fatin, M., Rasha, A.E., Marionet, Z.N., Mohammed, S.R., 2016. Bacterial and Chemical quality of Frozen Chicken Meat Received at Governmental Hospital modern. *Benha Vet. Med. J.*, 30(1): 109-117.
- International Commission and Microbiological Specification for Foods "ICMSF" 1996. *Microorganisms in foods. Intestinally pathogenic E.coli*. Blackie Academic and Professional, London.
- Iqbal, M.N., Ali, S., Anjum, A.A., Muhammad, K., Ali, M.A., Wang, S., Khan, W.A., Khan, I., Muhammad, A., Mahmood, A., Irfan, M., Ahmad, A., Ashraf, A., Hussain, F., 2016. Microbiological Risk Assessment of Packed Fruit Juices and Antibacterial Activity of Preservatives against Bacterial Isolates. *Pak. J. Zool.*, 48(6): 1695-1703.
- Kalantar, E., Alikhani, M.Y., Naseri, M.H., Torabi, V., 2013. Antibiotic resistance patterns of STEC and ETEC strains: a study on frozen foods of animal origin and children with acute diarrhea. *J. Microbiol. Infect. Dis.*, 3(1): 31-5.
- Kilonzo-Nthenge, A., Rotich, E., Nahashon, S.N., 2013. Evaluation of drug-resistant Enterobacteriaceae in retail poultry and beef. *Poult. Sci.*, 92(4): 1098–1107.
- Lee, G.Y., Jang, H.I., Hwang, I.G., Rhee, M.S., 2009. Prevalence and classification of pathogenic *Escherichia coli* isolated from fresh beef, poultry, and pork in Korea. *Inter. J. Food Microbiol.*, 134: 196-200.
- MacFaddin, J. F., 2000. *Biochemical tests for identification medical bacteria*. Waryery Press Inc, Baltimore, Md. 21202 USA.

- Mohammad, A., Nossair, N.A., El Shabasy, O. S., Hassan, I. A., Samaha, 2015. Microbiological Status of Poultry Carcasses from Retailed Outlets in Alexandria Province. 46(1): 66-73.
- Millman, J.M., Waits, K., Grande, H., Marks, A.R., Marks, J.C., Price, L.B., Hungate, B.A., 2013. Prevalence of antibiotic resistant *E.coli* in retail chicken: comparing conventional, organic, kosher, and raised without antibiotics. Version 2. F1000Res., 2: 155.
- Olobatoke, R., Mulugeta, S., Mwanza, M., 2015. Incidence and Antimicrobial Susceptibility of Coliforms in Broiler Products at the North West Province of South Africa. Food Prot. Trends., 35(1) : 49–55.
- Purabi , S., Joshi, S.R., 2010. Retail Market Poultry Meats of North East India – Amicrobiological Survey for pathogenic contaminants. Res. J. Microbiol., 5(1):36-43.
- Ruban, S.W., Fairoze, N., 2011. Effect of Proceesing Conditions on I/microbiological Quality of Market Poultry Meats in Bangalore, India. J. Anim. Vet. Adv., 10(2): 188-191.
- Rasool , S. A., Ahmad, A., Khan, S., Wahab A., 2003. Plasmid borne antibiotic resistance factors among indigenous Klebsiella. Pak. J. Bot., 35: 243–248.
- Shawish, R., 2011. Microbial evaluation of some retailed cut-up chicken and poultry meat products, M.V.Sc., Thesis, Fac. of Vet. Med., menofia univ., sadat branch.
- Saif-Marwa, Z.M.A., 2015. Bacterial Status of Fresh Marketed chicken cuts. M. V. Sc. Thesis, Meat Hygiene, Fac. of Vet. Med. Moshtohor. Benha Univ.
- Shrestha, A., Bajracharya, A.M., Subedi , H., Turha , R.S., Kafle, S., Sharma, S., Neupane, S., Chaudhary, D.K., 2017. Multi-drug Resistance and Extended Spectrum Beta Lactamase Producing Gram Negative Bacteria From Chicken Meat in Bharatpur Metropolitan, Nepal. BMC Res. Notes., 10(1): 574.
- Tiwari, R., Chakraborty, S., Saminathan, M., Dhama, K., Singh, S., 2014. Ashwagandha (*Withania somnifera*): Role in safeguarding health, immunomodulatory effects, combating infections and therapeutic applications: A review. 14: 77-94.
- Tollefson, L., Flynn, W.T., 2002. Impact of antimicrobial resistance on regulatory policies in veterinary medicine: Status report. 4: 150-159.
- Varnam, P.H., Evans, M.G., 1991. Food borne pathogens. An illustrated Text book. Wolfe publishing Ltd, New York, App 101-118.
- Yadav, M.M., Tale, S., Sharda, R., Sharma, V., Tiwari, S., Garg, U.K., 2006. Bacteriological quality of sheep meat in Mhow town of India. Inter. J. Food Sci. Technol., 41: 1234–1238.
- Yulistiani, R., Praseptiangga, D., Supyani, Sudibya, Raharjo, D., Shirakawa, T., 2017. Prevalence of Antibiotic-resistance Enterobacteriaceae strains Isolated from Chicken Meat at Traditional Markets in Surabaya, Indonesia. IOP Conference Series: Materials Science and Engineering, Volume 193, Issue 1, pp. 012007.